

City of Cardiff Council

Alternative Delivery Models

Assessment Panel Pack

Part 3: Scoring

Scoring system

Introduction

The ADM Model Scoring is the first stage of the two stages in the ADM Evaluation Methodology scoring system, the second stage is assigning criteria weightings for a specific service. The suggested delivery model will be the Model that receives the highest score when multiplying the model score by the criteria weighting. It must be stressed that the Methodology is an aid to decision-making. It is not the sole mechanism for determining the outcome but will be taken into account in the Outline Business Case along with other factors.

Scoring the Model

Each shortlisted delivery model should be scored according to its ability to deliver against each of the eight Key Criteria / Critical Objectives. All models should be scored on a 1 to 6 scale in terms of their ability to achieve each criteria, where 1 represents a minimum ability and 6 a maximum ability. The Assessment Panel Pack (Part 2) Guidance provides a description of each Model before providing a “Commentary on Characteristics of Model in Respect of the Evaluation Criteria” and should be referenced when completing the Model scoring. The basic assumptions that need to be taken into account are:

- **Modified In-house:** That the ability to trade commercially focusses on earning income from sources **outside** the local authority, taking into account statutory limitations on such ability to trade, such as cost recovery, rather than for revenue/profit maximisation;
- **Wholly owned arms-length company:** That it would be subject to a “Teckal exemption”, and hence the trading activity of the company from sources outside the Council must not exceed 20% of its turnover. The Council can passport work to the company without a competitive procurement process;
- **Public/Public JV:** That it would be subject to a “Teckal exemption”, and hence the trading activity of the company from sources outside its owners must not exceed 20% of its turnover. The Council can passport work to the company without a competitive procurement process. That a 50:50 share of ownership is assumed.
- **Public/Private JV:** No limitations on trading ability. That a competitive dialogue procurement of a JV partner is required. That the authority would have a minority ownership.
- **Outsourcing:** No limitations on trading ability. That a competitive dialogue procurement process is required.

Scoring Matrix

	Evaluation Criterion Statement Weighting	Question to Ask When Assigning Model Score	Modified In- house	Council Owned Trading Company	Public/Public Joint Venture	Public/Private Joint Venture	Outsourcing
1.	How important is that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to transfer risk in relation to cost reductions	Ability of model to transfer risk for achieving cost savings away from the Council?					
2.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to exploit income opportunities	Ability of model to exploit income generation opportunities					
3.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to maintain influence and control over day to day decision making	Ability of the Model of allow the Council to maintain influence and control over day to day decision making					
4.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council flexibility to change service scope and delivery specifications in future years	Ability of the Model to allow the Council to change service scope and delivery specifications in future years					

5.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to transfer risk in respect of operational performance	Ability of model to transfer risk in respect of operational performance					
6.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to transfer risk in respect of repaying financial investment (if required)	Ability of Model to transfer risk in respect of repaying financial investment (if required)					
7.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to improve service delivery performance and increase capacity	Ability of Model to improve service delivery performance and increase capacity					
8.	How important is it that the chosen model for service delivery will allow the Council to realise benefits within the short term.	Ability of Model to realise benefits in the short term					